Handedness and musical abilities in secondary school students

Lottie Anstee¹, Daniel Müllensiefen² and Peter Harrison¹

¹Centre for Music & Science, Faculty of Music, University of Cambridge, ²Goldsmiths, University of London

Introduction

Handedness: difference in performance and preference between the hands Prior research has found:

- non-right-handedness to be associated with cognitive deficits,¹ heightened creativity and superior musical talent²
- improved pitch and rhythmic memory for left-handed subjects^{3,4}
- a higher incidence of left-handedness in musicians⁵

However, conflicting studies have found:

• non-right-handedness to have no correlation with musical ability⁶

• similar incidences of left-handedness in musicians and non-musicians⁷ This study aims to resolve some of the uncertainty, whilst addressing limitations of previous work, including:

- a much larger participant group assessed through their developmental years
- greater diversity of relevant musical and non-musical covariates

Participants

2,902 secondary school students from thirteen schools

- \circ aged 10 to 18
- \circ mean age: 12.85 years (*SD* = 2.00) \circ schools in the UK and Germany

```
(0) 13.2% non-right-
handed 84.3% right-
handed
```

All participant data taken from the international longitudinal study of educational development in adolescents: the LongGold project⁸

Methods

The LongGold project assesses students' musical, academic and personal skills annually through repeated measures design.

Handedness is measured using two self-report questions on hand preference.

Four main response variables from the test battery used:

- 1. Objective musicality: average of three adaptive tests of musical ability
- 2. Self-reported musicality: Gold-MSI self-report inventory
- 3. General intelligence: score on a Matrix Reasoning Test
- 4. Overall academic performance: summary of students' school grades



Example of a question on the adaptive rhythmic test of musical ability



Standardised regression coefficients (β) for right-handedness:

Response variable	β	95% CI	p-value
Overall academic performance	0.10	[0.047, 0.16]	.063
General intelligence (IQ)	0.11	[0.060, 0.16]	.026
Overall objective musicality	-0.012	[-0.059, 0.035]	.80
Overall self-reported musicality	-0.027	[-0.083, 0.029]	.63

Multiple linear regression analysis, controlling for potential confounds of gender, age and school, found:

- No significant relationship between handedness and both objective and selfreported musicality
- An association between right-handedness and both general intelligence and overall academic performance

Comparison benchmarking age analysis:

- Difference in intelligence between being right- and non-right-handed equivalent to becoming 1.9 years older
- Highlights small effect of handedness

Discussion

- Present study contradicts prior research that found a relationship between non-right-handedness and musicianship^{2,3,4,5}
- Idea that non-right-handed people have an innate proclivity for music due to greater interhemispheric interaction for music perception was not borne out by findings
- Dispelling misconceptions of innate differences for left-handers
- Reverse causal explanation that musicians become more mixedhanded over time cannot yet be discounted
- Tendency for right-handers to academically outperform non-righthanders suggests a stronger association than the negligible relationship of recent meta-analyses⁹
- Limitations: reductionist and binary measure of handedness, lack of generalisability to students with lower socioeconomic status
- Future research: compare samples of adults and children or conduct an extended longitudinal study to explore how the adolescent sample could explain conflict with previous research through a speculative theory of changing dexterity in musicians

References

- Geschwind, N. & Galaburda, A. M. (1985). Cerebral lateralisation: Biological mechanisms, associations, and pathology: I. A hypothesis and a program for research. *Arch Neurol.*, 42(5), 428-459. doi:10.1001/archneur.1985.04060050026008
- Hassler, M. & Birbaumer, N. (1988). Handedness, musical abilities, and dichaptic and dichotic performance in adolescents: A longitudinal study. *Developmental Neuropsychology*, 4(2), 129-145. doi:10.1080/87565648809540399
- Deutsch, D. (1980). Handedness and memory for tonal pitch. In J. Heron (Ed.), Neuropsychology of Left-handedness (pp. 263-271). New York, NY: Academic Press.
- 4. Craig, J. D. (1980). A dichotic rhythm task: Advantage for the left-handed. *Cortex*, *16*(4), 613-620. doi:10.1016/S0010-9452(80)80008-6
- Aggleton, J. P., Kentridge, R. W. & Good, J. M. M. (1994). Handedness and musical ability: A study of professional orchestral players, composers, and choir members. *Psychology of Music*, 22(2), 148-156. doi:10.1177/0305735694222004
- Byrne, B. (1974). Handedness and musical ability. Br. J. Psychol., 65(2), 279-281. doi:10.1111/j.2044-8295.1974.tb01402.x
- Götestam, K. O. (1990). Lefthandedness among students of architecture and music. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, 70(3), 1323-1327. doi:10.2466/pms.1990.70.3c.1323
- Müllensiefen, D., Gingras, B., Musil, J., & Stewart, L. (2014). The musicality of nonmusicians: An index for assessing musical sophistication in the general population. *PloS One*, 9, e89642. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0089642
- Papadatou-Pastou, M. (2018). Handedness and cognitive ability: using meta-analysis to make sense of the data. Progress in Brain Research, 238, 179-206. doi:10.1016/bs.pbr.2018.06.008

Presented at Sempre 50th Anniversary Conference